

Data Validation Results for Validation Year 2014 Compared with 2013

Overview

Compared with the previous validation year (VY), DV results during 2014 continued to improve in most areas. Overall, the rate of items passing or not due increased by 3 percentage points to 61%. However, the submission rate edged down because of slightly lower submission of Module 4 results. Overall, states submitted 76% of DV items due. More of what was submitted passed: the pass rate improved 5% for Benefits population results and 3% for Tax populations. However, the pass rate fell by 0.9% for Modules 4 and 5. Four states submitted no Benefits populations and six submitted no Tax populations; three submitted no Module 4 or 5 validations. Only one state, the Virgin Islands, submitted no DV items at all, down from two in 2013.

All Data Validation Results, VY 2014 vs. VY 2013							
	Total				Percents of Total Items		
Validation	Pass/ND	Failed	Not Submitted	Total	Pass/ND	Failed	Not Submitted
<i>Validation Year 2014</i>							
Benefits-2014	473	148	212	833	56.8%	17.8%	25.5%
Tax-2014	160	43	62	265	60.4%	16.2%	23.4%
Module 4 & 5-2014	291	40	93	424	68.6%	9.4%	21.9%
All 2014	924	231	367	1522	60.7%	15.1%	24.1%
<i>Validation Year 2013</i>							
Benefits-2013	429	190	214	833	51.5%	22.8%	25.7%
Tax-2013	152	56	57	265	57.4%	21.1%	21.5%
Module 4 & 5-2013	295	46	83	424	69.6%	10.8%	19.6%
All 2013	876	292	354	1522	57.6%	19.2%	23.3%
<i>Change from VY 2013 to VY 2014</i>							
Benefits	43	-41	-2	0	5.2%	-4.9%	-0.2%
Tax	8	-13	5	0	3.0%	-4.9%	1.9%
Module 4 & 5	-4	-6	10	0	-0.9%	-1.4%	2.4%
All Items	47	-60	13	0	3.1%	-3.9%	0.9%

Benefits Populations

Comparing the populations validated in both 2013 and 2014, the number of populations passed or not due because of previous passes stood at 57% at the end of VY 2014, an increase from VY 2013, and the number of populations not submitted fell by about 0.2 percentage points from the year before. Populations 2, and the Appeals Populations (6-11), remained the easiest to validate, with pass rates over 70%. The easiest is Population 6; almost 85% passed validation. The most difficult Population to pass is 4, Payments, (26%) followed by Population 3 (34%) and the ETA 227 report populations (12-15) all falling in the 32-37% passing rate range. The apparent 1.6 percentage point erosion in number of submitted benefits reports from 2013 to 2014 was due to the inclusion of Population 15 results, which had been omitted in the 2012-2013 comparison.

U.S. Totals for DV Benefits Population Results in VY 2014							
	Benefits						
	Number of State Validations				Percents of Total Due		
Population	Pass/ND	Failed	Not Submitted	Due	Pass/ND	Failed	Not Submitted
1	36	8	9	53	67.9%	15.1%	17.0%
2	40	2	11	53	75.5%	3.8%	20.8%
3	18	17	18	53	34.0%	32.1%	34.0%
3a	33	9	11	53	62.3%	17.0%	20.8%
4*	14	19	20	53	26.4%	35.8%	37.7%
5	27	11	15	53	50.9%	20.8%	28.3%
6	45	1	7	53	84.9%	1.9%	13.2%
7	37	4	7	48	77.1%	8.3%	14.6%
8	39	5	9	53	73.6%	9.4%	17.0%
9	34	4	10	48	70.8%	8.3%	20.8%
10	38	5	10	53	71.7%	9.4%	18.9%
11	35	6	7	48	72.9%	12.5%	14.6%
12*	18	15	20	53	34.0%	28.3%	37.7%
13	18	14	21	53	34.0%	26.4%	39.6%
14	20	15	18	53	37.7%	28.3%	34.0%
15	21	13	19	53	39.6%	24.5%	35.8%
All 2014	473	148	212	833	56.8%	17.8%	25.5%
All 2013	415	179	186	833	53.2%	22.9%	23.8%
Change	58	-31	26	0	3.6%	-5.2%	1.6%

Tax

The Tax pass rate was up to about 60%, up nicely from last year's rate of 57%. The submitted-but-failed rate was down to 16% in VY 2014, compared to 21% for the previous validation year. In 2014, six states submitted no tax population results, down from 9 in 2012 and 13 in 2011. Among the tax populations, 1 is by far the easiest to validate (over 80% pass rate); Population 4 is the most difficult at 32%. The pass rate for Population 3, the GPRA Tax population, is now up to 57%, which is substantially over the two Benefits GPRA populations pass rate for populations 4 and 12 (26% and 34% respectively). The submitted-but-failed rate fell more than the pass rate, indicating that some states decided not to submit failing results in 2014.

U.S. Totals for DV Tax Population Results in VY 2014							
Tax							
	Number of State Validations				Percents of Total Due		
Population	Pass/ND	Failed	Not Submitted	Due	Pass/ND	Failed	Not Submitted
1	43	3	7	53	81.1%	5.7%	13.2%
2	36	7	10	53	67.9%	13.2%	18.9%
3	30	10	13	53	56.6%	18.9%	24.5%
4	17	18	18	53	32.1%	34.0%	34.0%
5	34	5	14	53	64.2%	9.4%	26.4%
All 2014	160	43	62	265	60.4%	16.2%	23.4%
All 2013	152	56	57	265	57.4%	21.1%	21.5%
Change	8	-13	5	0	3.0%	-4.9%	1.9%

Modules 4 and 5

Pass rates declined slightly from 2013, from about 70% to 69%, and the non-submission rate rose about 2 points. Overall, pass rates were higher for Mods 4 and 5 than for Benefits or Tax populations. The Wage Item Validation was the easiest to pass; all 41 states that completed it successfully passed. This was followed by the Field Audit Acceptance sample. All Module 4 validation pass rates exceeded 60%. Only three States submitted no Module 4 or 5 validations in 2014: Virgin Islands, Oklahoma, and Idaho. They accounted for 26% of the validations due but not submitted in 2014. Overall, the number of non-submitted validations for Mods 4 and 5 in VY2014 rose by 10.

U.S. Totals for Module 4 and 5 Results in VY 2014							
Modules 4 and 5							
	Number of State Validations				Percents of Total Due		
Validation	Pass/ND	Failed	Not Submitted	Due	Pass/ND	Failed	Not Submitted
Seps	35	6	12	53	66.0%	11.3%	22.6%
Nonseps	32	9	12	53	60.4%	17.0%	22.6%
Appeal	34	5	14	53	64.2%	9.4%	26.4%
New Stat	35	6	12	53	66.0%	11.3%	22.6%
Successor	34	8	11	53	64.2%	15.1%	20.8%
Inact/Term	37	5	11	53	69.8%	9.4%	20.8%
Field Aud	43	1	9	53	81.1%	1.9%	17.0%
Wage Item	41	0	12	53	77.4%	0.0%	22.6%
2014 Totals	291	40	93	424	68.6%	9.4%	21.9%
2013 Totals	295	46	83	424	69.6%	10.8%	19.6%
Change	-4	-6	10	0	-0.9%	-1.4%	2.4%

State Performance Notes

1. The Non-Submitters

The number of States with zero Tax submissions rose by one in 2014, from five to six states. These states were:

- Virgin Islands, Pennsylvania, Colorado, New Mexico, Nevada, and Indiana.

Four states submitted no Benefits Population results:

- Massachusetts, Virgin Islands, New Mexico, Oregon

Three states submitted no Module 4 or 5 results:

- Virgin Islands, Oklahoma, Idaho

Only one state (Virgin Islands) submitted no DV results.

2. Who Improved, Who Regressed

The following table identifies the top and lowest performing states for improvement or decline in Benefit Populations, Tax Populations, and Module 4&5 validations. The criteria are the change in the non-submission of “Items Due” and the items Passed or Not Due between VY 2013 and VY 2014. Declining values are in red. Improvement in “Items Due and Submitted” is a decline in “Items Due and Not Submitted.” For example, in 2013, Colorado had all 16 Benefits populations due and submitted none; in 2014, it reduced its number of due-but-not-submitted to 6 by validating 10 populations. At the other end of the range, the number of populations due but not submitted by Idaho and Rhode Island rose by 10 from 2013 to 2014.

Change from 2013 to 2014: States With Largest Change by Type of DV Item				
<i>All DV Items: Submission of DV Results Due</i>				
Rank	State	Improvement	State	Decline
1	Colorado, Indiana	10	Idaho	-14
2	Minnesota	8	Rhode Island	-13
3	California	7	IL, ND, NV, PR	-5
<i>All DV Items: Passed + Not Due</i>				
1	Kansas	12	MI, RI	-9
2	NC, IN	9	ME,CT,LA,GA,NV	-4
3	Nebraska	8	WY,MD,NH	-2
<i>Benefits Population Results: Submission of Results Due</i>				
Rank	State	Improvement	State	Decline
1	Colorado	10	ID, RI	-10
2	Indiana	9	Nevada	-5
3	Missouri, Washington	4	Michigan	-4

<i>Benefits Population Results: Passed + Not Due</i>				
1	Indiana	8	Rhode Island	-9
2	Missouri	7	Michigan	-5
3	OK, KS, NC	6	Nevada	-4
<i>Tax Population Results: Submission of Results Due</i>				
1	Michigan	3	Idaho	-4
2	Mississippi, NC	2	ND, RI	-2
3	8 states	1	7 states	-1
<i>Tax Population Results: Passed + Not Due</i>				
1	Arkansas	3	11 states	-1
2	MS, NC	2		
3	8 states	1		
<i>Module 4 and 5 Results: Submission of Results Due</i>				
1	Minnesota	7	GA, PR	-4
2	California	6	CT,MI,IL,PA,LA	-3
3	Indiana	2	HI	-2
<i>Module 4 and 5 Results: Passed + Not Due</i>				
1	Minnesota	7	Louisiana	-5
2	California	4	Georgia	-4
3	NE, KS	3	MS, MI, CT, NE,PA	-3

The Outlook for VY 2015

Overall, further progress can be expected in 2015. The Virgin Islands and Louisiana are receiving technical assistance from Mathematica Policy Research. Idaho and New Mexico are working intensively on DV as is New York now that its new benefits system is becoming operational. Many of the declines in performance have occurred in states that have previously completed—if not passed—validations, and so have a history of validation and presumably an intact structure. Once they get through the transition to new staff, validation activity can be expected to resume. States are now more familiar with the revised 227 report and consequently with populations 12 – 15.

The Treasury Offset Program (TOP) reporting procedures will have implications for Benefits Population 13, Overpayments Reconciliation. TOP recoveries will not be included in the data validation extract files for the population because the records will likely contain federal tax information (FTI), particularly for subpopulations 13.01 and 13.04 as well as line 314 in the 227 report. State employees and contractors are prohibited from working with data containing FTI. Module 4 results will also be submitted using the state data validation software directly to the National Office using a new application in the software. Module 4 passing requirements stipulate that (1) all records in the sampling universe be in the reporting period and (2) the report counts used to compare the sampling universe have passed validation. Submission instructions have been added to the UI DV webpage.